Race and Track Assignment in Public School

Samuel R. Lucas University of California-Berkeley*

and

Mark Berends Vanderbilt University

RC28 Annual Winter Meeting March 1-3, 2003

*We thank Grace K. Kim for providing the measures of racial diversity used in this paper, Liz Cohen and Magdelena Ruiz Gonzalez for helpful comments on an earlier draft, and Carl Mason for computing assistance. Research for this paper was supported by a grant from the Field Initiated Studies Program, Office of Educational Research and Improvement, U.S. Department of Education, under grant number R305F960164 and by a grant from The Spencer Foundation, under grant number 199700213. However, this paper does not necessarily reflect the views of the granting agencies, and all errors are the reponsibility of the authors. We use HLM5.25 running on a Sun Microsystems E-450 with 2 CPUs and 4 GB of RAM in model estimation. All work for this paper was conducted with the assistance of the Demography Department of the University of California-Berkeley. A version of this paper was presented at the American Education Research Association Annual Meeting in New Orleans, LA, April 2002 and at the 40th Anniversary Symposium of the Center for Demography and Ecology, University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA, October 2002. Please direct all correspondence to Samuel R. Lucas / Sociology Department / University of California-Berkeley / 410 Barrows Hall #1980 / Berkeley, CA 94720-1980 or via email to Lucas@demog.berkeley.edu

Table 1 -- Selected Studies of Race and Curricular Assignment in Secondary School

Study	Sample	Dependent Variable	Key Controls	Statistical Model	Key Finding				
Social-Psychological	Social-Psychological								
Gamoran and Mare 1989	HS&B	College/non- college dichotomy	SES, Achievement, Gender	Endogenous Switching Regression	Black Advantage				
Jones, Vanfossen, and Ensminger 1995	HS&B	General, College Prep, Vocational Trichotomy	SES, Gender, Achievement	Multinomial Logit	Black Advantage				
Structural Track									
Oakes 1985	National Represent ative	Vocational and Remedial Courses versus Others	None	None ¹	Black and Latino/a Disadvantage				
Garet and DeLany 1989	Four CA districts	Math and Science Courses	Gender	Multinomial Logit	Black and Asian Advantage				
Mickelson 2001	Charlotte , NC	English Courses	SES, Cultural Capital, Gender	Multi-level Regression	Black Disadvantage				
Lucas and Gamoran 2002	HS&B and NELS	College/non- college dichotomy	Disaggregated SES, Achievement, Gender	Endogenous Switching Regression	Consistent black- white parity; 1980 Latino Disadvantage, 1990 Asian Advantage				

 $^{^{\}mbox{\tiny 1}}$ No explicit statistical model is provided.

Multi-level Logistic Regression Models

$$\begin{array}{lll} 1a) & \log(\frac{p_{ij}}{1-p_{ij}}) = \beta_{1j} + \beta_{2j} Black_{ij} + b_{3j} Latinoa_{ij} + \\ & \qquad \qquad \beta_{4j} Asian_{ij} + b_{5j} OtherRace_{ij} + \sum_{k=6}^{K} \beta_k X_{ijk} + \epsilon_{ijk} \\ 1b) & \qquad \beta_{1j} = \gamma_{01} + \delta_{1j} \\ 1c) & \qquad \beta_{2j} = \gamma_{02} + \delta_{2j} \\ 1d) & \qquad \beta_{3j} = \gamma_{03} + \delta_{3j} \\ 1e) & \qquad \beta_{4j} = \gamma_{04} + \delta_{4j} \\ 1f) & \qquad \beta_{5j} = \gamma_{05} + \delta_{5j} \end{array}$$

where p_{ij} signifies the probability student i in school j will be in the college track, and Black, Latino/a, Asian, and Other Race are mutually exclusive race/ethnicity dummies with White as the omitted category, X_{ijk} signifies additional observed individual-level factors, ϵ_{ij} is an individual-level logistically distributed error term with mean zero and variance $\pi^2/3$, δ_j 's signify school-level normally distributed error terms with mean zero and variance-covariance matrix T, and $cov(\epsilon,\delta_k)=0$. Equation 1a is at the student-level and captures individual-level factors expected to matter for track placement. Equations 1b through 1f are school-level equations in which the school-level intercept and the intercept-shift for different racial/ethnic groups are all allowed to vary across schools.

Multi-level Multinomial Logit Models

2a)
$$\log(p_{1ij}/p_{3ij}) = \beta_{11j} + \beta_{12j} Black_{ij} + b_{13j} Latinoa_{ij} + \sum_{K=0}^{K} \beta_{1}kX_{ijk} + \epsilon_{1ij}$$

$$\beta_{14j} Asian_{ij} + b_{15j} OtherRace_{ij} + \sum_{K=0}^{K} \beta_{1}kX_{ijk} + \epsilon_{1ij}$$
2b) $\beta_{ij} = 10 + \delta_{ij}$

- $eta_{11j} = \gamma_{011} + \delta_{11j}$
- 2c) $\beta_{12j} = \gamma_{012} + \delta_{12j}$
- 2d) $\beta_{13i} = \gamma_{013} + \delta_{13i}$
- 2e) $\beta_{14j} = \gamma_{014} + \delta_{14j}$
- 2f) $\beta_{15i} = \sqrt{0.15} + \delta_{15i}$

3a)
$$\log(p_{2ij}/p_{3ij}) = \beta_{21j} + \beta_{22j} Black_{ij} + b_{23j} Latinoa_{ij} + \beta_{24j} Asian_{ij} + b_{25j} OtherRace_{ij} + \sum_{k=6}^{K} \beta_k X_{ijk} + \epsilon_{2ij}$$

- 3b) $\beta_{21j} = \gamma_{021} + \delta_{21j}$
- 3c) $\beta_{22j} = \gamma_{022} + \delta_{22j}$
- 3d) $\beta_{23j} = \gamma_{023} + \delta_{23j}$ 3e) $\beta_{24j} = \gamma_{024} + \delta_{24j}$ 3f) $\beta_{25j} = \gamma_{025} + \delta_{25j}$

where \mathbf{p}_{3ij} signifies the probability student i in school j will be in the college prep math p_{2ij} signifies the probability student i in school j will be in the non-college prep math, p_{1ij} signifies the probability student i in school j will not take math, Black, Latino/a, Asian, and Other Race are mutually exclusive race/ethnicity dummies with White as the omitted category, X_{ijk} signifies additional observed individual-level factors, ϵ_{1ij} and ϵ_{2ij} are individual-level logistically distributed error terms with mean zero and variance $\pi^2/3$, δ_i 's signify school-level normally distributed error terms with mean zero and variance-covariance matrix T, and $\text{cov}(\epsilon_{\text{cij}},\delta_{\text{ck}})\text{=0.}$ Equations 2a and 3a are at the student-level; other equations are school-level equations in which the school-level intercept and the intercept-shift for different racial/ethnic groups are all allowed to vary across schools. In this model the omitted dependent variable category is the college preparatory track. With this model it becomes possible to assess whether there are racial differences in assignment to some specific locations, allowing a more finegrained analysis of race and track assignment.

Table 2 -- Independent Variables

All variables are recoded to the midpoint for missing cases. In the models a control for missing on each particular variable is used.

STUDENT LEVEL

Black, White, Latino/a, Asian, Other are mutually-exclusive categorizations of students' racial/ethnic group drawn from student reports.

Female is a dummy variable drawn from student self-reports.

Mother's and Father's Education was measured by student reports of mother's and father's education, scored ranging from 10 years to 18 years of schooling.

Father's Occupation was measured by student responses to a 17 category question, which were recoded to the 1980 SEI score of the mean of the illustrative occupations in the questionnaire using Stevens and Cho's (1985) updated occupational scores for total labor force based on the 1980 census. Homemakers and military were coded as missing given that there is no SEI code for those pursuits.

Family Income was measured by student reports of family income, recoded to the mid-point of categories.

Siblings is the number of brothers and sisters reported by the student.

Broken Family is scored 0 if the child lived with mother and father in sophomore year, and zero otherwise.

Seven 10th grade tests in Math 1 (range 0-28), Math 2 (0-10), Reading (0-19), Vocabulary (range 0-21), Writing (0-17), Science (0-20), and Civics (0-10) are used to measure prior achievement.

SCHOOL LEVEL

School Poverty

Principal reports of 1)whether the school is a **Title 1** school, 2)the natural log of the number of **Library Volumes per child**, 3)whether the school has a **Library or Not**, and 3)the **Expenditures Per Student**. (No library)

Governance

Dummy variables for **Urban**, **Rural**, and **South**. **Size** of school is the principal's report of the total enrollment of students; we use the natural log of the total enrollment.

Faculty Sponsorship

Principal reports of the percentage of faculty who are Black.

Legacy of Racial Conflict

Principal reports of 1)the proportion of students **Bused** into the school for racial balance and 2)whether the school is under a **Desegregation** order.

Racial/Ethnic Diversity

Principal reports of the proportion of students who are white, Black, Latino/a, Asian, or Native American, coupled with principal reports of the number of students in the school, is used to construct a measure of the incidence of racial/ethnic diversity, calculated as follows. If k>1 then $D_{\rm s}=(k(N^2-\Sigma f_{\rm sk}^2))$ / $(N^2(k-1));$ if k=1 then $D_{\rm s}=0$, where k is the number of racial groups in the school, N is the total number of students in the school, and $f_{\rm sk}$ is the number of persons of race k in school s.

Table 3 -- Unconditional Multi-Level Multinomial Logistic Regression Model and Tests of Varying Race/Ethnicity Coefficients, Trichotomous Mathematics Track Assignment, Public Schools (n=798) and Students (n=11211)

Panel 1--Model Coefficients

Unconditional Model	Parameter	Coeff	S.E.	Var Component	P-val			
College Prep Math vs. No Math								
	Intercept	-1.379*	0.055	1.0231	>0.500			
	Black	0.301	0.111	0.1864	>0.500			
	Latino/a	0.491*	0.086	0.1825	>0.500			
	Asian	-1.818*	0.342	0.1740	>0.500			
	Other	0.651*	0.215	0.1264	>0.500			
College Prep Math	vs. Non-Col	lege Prep	Math					
	Intercept	-0.534*	0.044	0.7448	0.001			
	Black	0.939	0.076	0.0122	0.168			
	Latino/a	0.819*	0.063	0.0016	0.310			
	Asian	-1.528*	0.226	0.0240	0.428			
	Other	0.971*	0.163	0.0157	>0.500			

Italics denote varying coefficients, * signifies parameter discernibly different from zero at or below α =.05

Panel 2 -- Probablities of Track Assignment

	No Math	Non-Coll Prep	Coll Prep
Intercept	.201	.370	.429
Black	.254	.600	.146
Latino/a	.292	.571	.138
Asian	.039	.113	.848
Other	.326	.608	.067

Numbers may not add up to 1 due to rounding.

Table 4 -- Conditional Multi-Level Multinomial Logistic Regression Models and Tests of Trichotomous Mathematics Track Assignment, Public Schools (n=798) and Students (n=11211)

Panel 1--Selected Model Coefficients, Conditional Model 1

	Parameter	Coeff	S.E.	Var Component	P-val			
Model 1 College Prep Math vs. No Math								
	Intercept	-1.380*	0.080	1.3007	0.128			
	Black	-0.490*	0.125	0.5442	>0.500			
	Latino/a	-0.197*	0.097	0.1895	>0.500			
	Asian	-1.187*	0.353	0.0937	>0.500			
	Other	0.018	0.227					
Model 1 College	e Prep Math	vs. Non-Co	ollege P	rep Math				
	Intercept	-0.504*	0.064	0.7448	0.002			
	Black	0.068	0.093	0.0122	0.025			
	Latino/a	0.082	0.075	0.0016	>0.500			
	Asian	-1.066*	0.262	0.0240	>0.500			
	Other ¹	0.323*	0.181					

Italics denote varying coefficients, * signifies parameter discernibly different from zero at or below α =.05

Panel 2 -- Conditional Probablities of Track Assignment

	No Math	Non-Coll Prep	Coll Prep
Intercept	.201	.377	.422
Black	.134	.393	.474
Latino/a	.171	.397	.433
Asian	.071	.172	.756
Other	.204	.455	.341

Numbers may not add up to 1 due to rounding.

 $^{^{\}rm 1}$ Could not allow Other to vary in this model, for to do so would have allowed no degrees of freedom for the test of school-level variance.

Panel 3--Selected Model Coefficients, Conditional Model 2

	Parameter	Coeff	S.E.	Var Component	P-val			
Model 2 College Prep Math vs. No Math								
	Intercept	Intercept $-1.387*$ 0.079 1.4511 \leq 0.0						
	Black	-0.483*	0.123	0.3887	>0.500			
	Latino/a	-0.211*	0.092					
	Asian	-1.257*	0.329					
	Other	0.020	0.209					
Model 2 College	e Prep Math	vs. Non-Co	ollege P:	rep Math				
	Intercept	-0.503*	0.063	1.0560	≤0.001			
	Black	0.063	0.092	0.1900	0.004			
	Latino/a	0.053	0.070					
	Asian	-1.006*	0.245					
	Other	0.329*	0.170					

Italics denote varying coefficients, * signifies parameter discernibly different from zero at or below $\alpha = .05$

Panel 4 -- Conditional Probablities of Track Assignment

	No Math	Non-Coll Prep	Coll Prep
Intercept	.200	.377	.423
Black	.134	.392	.475
Latino/a	.168	.389	.442
Asian	.067	.181	.753
Other	.203	.457	.340

Numbers may not add up to 1 due to rounding.

Table 5 -- Selected Coefficients, Conditional Multi-Level Multinomial Logistic Regression Models of Trichotomous Mathematics Track Assignment, Public Schools (n=798) and Students (n=11211)

Col Prep Omitted	No Math		Non-College Prep		
Parameter	Coeff	S.E.	Coeff	S.E	
School Poverty Model		<u>I</u>			
Intercept	-1.447*	0.124	-0.425*	0.101	
Title 1	0.100	0.117	-0.051	0.099	
Ln (Lib Vols/Child)	0.208*	0.096	-0.168*	0.082	
No Library	0.466	1.058	0.301	0.904	
\$1000/child	0.168	0.096	0.110	0.082	
Black	-0.488*	0.126	-0.108	0.161	
Title 1			0.050	0.160	
Ln (Lib Vols/Child)			-0.130	0.133	
No Library			-2.214	1.469	
\$1000/child			0.081	0.128	
Governance Model					
Intercept	1.427*	0.607	-0.852	0.557	
Ln(size)	-0.365*	0.084	0.077	0.077	
Urban	-0.097	0.140	-0.175	0.121	
Rural	0.046	0.136	-0.203	0.119	
South	-0.904*	0.121	-0.280*	0.101	
Black	-0.320*	0.128	-1.357	1.028	
Ln(size)			0.208	0.138	
Urban			-0.049	0.175	
Rural			0.077	0.236	
South			-0.003	0.166	
Faculty Sponsor Model					
Intercept	-1.431*	0.084	-0.493*	0.067	
% Black Faculty	-0.019*	0.004	-0.001	0.004	
Black	-0.256	0.131	0.274*	0.010	
% Black Faculty			-0.014*	0.004	
Legacy of Racial Conflict Model					
Intercept	-1.296*	0.085	-0.485*	0.069	
% Bused	0.002	0.007	-0.000	0.007	

Col Prep Omitted	No Math		Non-College Prep	
Parameter	Coeff	S.E.	Coeff	S.E
Desegregation Order	-0.598*	0.145	-0.131	0.122
Black	-0.394*	0.127	0.073	0.115
% Bused			0.007	0.006
Desegregation Order			-0.055	0.160
Racial Diversity Model				
Intercept	-1.431*	0.084	-0.515*	0.067
Index of Racial Diversity	-0.970*	0.195	-0.265	0.164
Black	-0.382*	0.129	0.066	0.114
Index of Racial Diversity			0.262	0.277

Italics denote varying coefficients, * signifies parameter discernibly different from zero at or below $\alpha = .05$

Table 6 -- Tests of Varying Race/Ethnicity Coefficients in Multi-level Binary Logistic Regression Models of Dichotomous Track Assignment, Public Schools (n=798) and Public School Students (n=11211)

Schools (n=7)	98) and Publ	ic School	Student	s (n=11211)	-	
Model	Parameter	Coeff	S.E.	Prob Col Prep	Var Component	P-val
Uncond Varying 1	Intercept	-0.552*	0.046	.365	1.0215	≤0.001
	Black	-0.681*	0.084	.226	0.5964	0.091
	Latino/a	-0.767*	0.067	.211	0.2367	0.030
	Asian	1.567*	0.237	.734	0.2278	≥0.500
	Other	-1.063*	0.192	.166	0.5264	≥0.500
Uncond Varying 2	Intercept	-0.555*	0.046	.365	1.0407	≤0.001
	Black	-0.676*	0.085	.226	0.6790	≤0.001
	Latino/a	-0.759*	0.067	.212	0.2517	≥0.500
	Asian	1.501*	0.217	.720		
	Other	-0.975*	0.173	.178		
Uncond Varying 3	Intercept	-0.553*	0.046	.365	1.0332	≤0.001
	Black	-0.689*	0.084	.224	0.4816	0.071
	Latino/a	-0.751*	0.063	.213		
	Asian	1.502*	0.217	.721		
	Other	-0.979*	0.173	.178		
Cond Varying 1	Intercept	-0.883*	0.068	.293	1.7610	≤0.001
	Black	0.159	0.100	.327	1.1879	0.228
	Latino/a	-0.019	0.075	.289	0.3761	0.162
	Asian	1.002*	0.272	.530	0.5726	≥0.500
	Other	-0.449*	0.209	.209	0.8424	≥0.500
Cond Varying 2	Intercept	-0.885*	0.068	.292	1.7688	≤0.001
	Black	0.160	0.101	.326	1.2927	≤0.001
	Latino/a	-0.013	0.076	.289	0.4473	0.396
	Asian	0.987*	0.240	.525		
	Other	-0.373*	0.189	.221		
Cond Varying 3	Intercept	-0.871*	0.067	.295	1.6537	≤0.001
	Black	0.143	0.099	.326	0.9243	0.008
	Black Latino/a	0.143	0.099	.326	0.9243	0.008
					0.9243	0.008

Varying coeffs italicized, *=parameter discernibly differs from zero α≤.05

Table 7 -- Multi-level Logistic Regression Models of Between-School Factors in Race and Track Assignment, Public Schools (n=798) and Students (n=11211)

	I-level Model		School Poverty		Governance		
	Coeff	S.E.	Coeff	S.E.	Coeff	S.E.	
Intercept	-0.871*	0.067	-0.867*	0.111	-1.025*	0.095	
Title 1			-0.038	0.113			
Ln(Lib Vols/Child)			0.009	0.094			
No Library			0.111	1.039			
\$1000/child			-0.086	0.093			
Ln(Size)					0.189*	0.086	
Urban					0.057	0.138	
Rural					0.075	0.134	
South					0.395*	0.115	
Black	0.143	0.099	0.363*	0.184	0.260	0.185	
Title 1			-0.209	0.192			
Ln(Lib Vols/Child)			0.518*	0.163			
No Library			4.140*	1.549			
Ln(\$/child)			-0.187	0.155			
Ln(Size)					-0.598*	0.163	
Urban					-0.007	0.213	
Rural					-0.262	0.279	
South					-0.088	0.202	
Latino/a	-0.058	0.072	-0.061	0.072	-0.080	0.072	
Asian	0.981*	0.238	0.976*	0.238	0.969*	0.238	
Other	-0.375*	0.188	-0.383*	0.188	-0.380*	0.189	
Female	0.400*	0.050	0.400*	0.050	0.400*	0.050	
Father's Ed	0.021	0.014	0.021	0.014	0.021	0.014	
Mother's Ed	0.057*	0.015	0.057*	0.015	0.058*	0.015	
Fathers Occ	0.001	0.001	0.001	0.001	0.001	0.001	
Family Income	0.011*	0.003	0.011*	0.003	0.011*	0.003	
Siblings	-0.042*	0.017	-0.042*	0.017	-0.040*	0.017	
Broken Family	-0.172*	0.069	-0.172*	0.069	-0.172*	0.069	
Math 1	0.144*	0.008	0.145*	0.008	0.145*	0.008	
Math 2	0.018	0.017	0.018	0.017	0.018	0.017	
Reading	0.017	0.011	0.016	0.011	0.017	0.011	

	I-level Model		School P	overty	Governance	
	Coeff	S.E.	Coeff	S.E.	Coeff	S.E.
Vocabulary	0.025*	0.009	0.026*	0.009	0.025*	0.009
Writing	0.058*	0.011	0.057*	0.010	0.058*	0.010
Science	0.002	0.011	0.002	0.011	0.004	0.011
Civics	0.074*	0.016	0.074*	0.016	0.073*	0.016

Italics denote varying coefficients, * signifies parameter discernibly different from zero at or below $\alpha = .05$

Table 7, continued

	Faculty Sponsor Model		Legacy of Racial Conflict		Racial Diversity	
	Coeff	S.E.	Coeff	S.E.	Coeff	S.E.
Intercept	-0.881*	0.069	-0.892*	0.072	-0.864*	0.069
% Black Fac	0.015*	0.004				
% Bused			-0.001	0.007		
Deseg Order			0.120	0.140		
Diversity					0.703*	0.184
Black	0.008	0.113	0.208	0.124	0.223	0.123
% Black Fac	0.004	0.005				
% Bused			-0.007	0.009		
Deseg Order			-0.078	0.201		
Diversity					-0.856*	0.339
Latino/a	-0.070	0.072	-0.060	0.072	-0.097	0.072
Asian	0.979*	0.238	0.983*	0.238	0.942*	0.237
Other	-0.385*	0.189	-0.380*	0.188	-0.390*	0.188
Female	0.399*	0.050	0.400*	0.050	0.400*	0.050
Father's Ed	0.022	0.014	0.021	0.014	0.021	0.014
Mother's Ed	0.057*	0.015	0.057*	0.015	0.057*	0.015
Fathers Occ	0.001	0.001	0.001	0.001	0.001	0.001
Family Income	0.011*	0.003	0.011*	0.003	0.011*	0.003
Siblings	-0.042*	0.017	-0.042*	0.017	-0.041*	0.017
Broken Family	-0.179*	0.069	-0.171*	0.069	-0.173*	0.069
Math 1	0.145*	0.008	0.144*	0.008	0.144*	0.008
Math 2	0.019	0.017	0.018	0.017	0.018	0.017
Reading	0.016	0.011	0.017	0.011	0.016	0.011
Vocabulary	0.025*	0.009	0.025*	0.009	0.024*	0.009
Writing	0.058*	0.010	0.058*	0.010	0.058*	0.010
Science	0.004	0.011	0.002	0.011	0.003	0.011
Civics	0.074*	0.016	0.074*	0.016	0.075*	0.016

Italics=varying parameters, *=estimate discernibly different from zero $\alpha \le .05$

Table 8 -- Selected Coefficients from Omnibus Multi-level Logistic Regression Model of Within-School Factors in Race and Track Assignment, Public Schools (n=798) and Students (n=11211)

	Omnibus Model		
	Coeff	S.E.	
Intercept	-0.948*	0.079	
Ln(Lib Vols/Child)	0.159	0.112	
No Library	0.704	1.068	
Ln(Size)	0.195*	0.092	
South	0.299*	0.121	
Diversity	0.499*	0.198	
Black	0.270	0.151	
Ln(Lib Vols/Child)	0.204	0.197	
No Library	2.745	1.594	
Ln(Size)	-0.342	0.176	
South	0.040	0.204	
Diversity	-0.898*	0.345	

Italics=varying parameters, *=estimate discernibly different from zero $\alpha {\leq} .05$